

Equitable Development Principles & Scorecard

A tool for communities and planners

2.0 version November 2015



Copyright through Creative Commons license allows for non-commercial free distribution, and the right to share, use, and build upon requiring credit to the original document.

Created in the Twin Cities, MN for public use by:

Asian Media Access, Aurora St. Anthony Neighborhood Development Corporation, Blake Road Corridor Collaborative, Centro de Trabajadores Unidos en la Lucha, Community Stabilization Project, Harrison Neighborhood Association, Heritage Park Neighborhood Association, Jewish Community Action, La Asamblea de Derechos Civiles, Lao Assistance Center of MN, Metropolitan Interfaith Council on Affordable Housing, New American Academy, Northside Residents Redevelopment Council, Umoja Community Development Corporation, Alliance for Metropolitan Stability, Nexus Community Partners, MN Center for Neighborhood Organizing.

Funding provided by Headwaters Foundation for Justice and the National Convergence Fund

TABLE OF CONTENTS

How to use scorecard.....	page 2
Equitable development principles and definitions.....	page 2
Glossary of development terms.....	page 4
Equitable Development Scorecard cover page.....	page A
Equitable Development Scorecard.....	page B - F

Feel free to tear off the scorecard and copy for community use.

We invite you to provide feedback on the process and to send us your questions at <http://bit.ly/EquityScorecard>. Or simply scan the QR code below:



How to use this scorecard

This scorecard was created by Twin Cities, MN community leaders to ensure that the principles and practices of equitable development, environmental justice, and affordability are applied in all communities as they plan for economic development and wealth creation that benefits everyone.

Suburban communities, rural communities, urban neighborhoods and cultural groups could use this scorecard for:

- Community based visioning/planning process with a focus on equity such as small area plan, development plan, or master plan.
- Scoring a proposed project.
- Scoring a development project currently in progress.
- Policy change recommendations.

Step #1: Review Scorecard.

Step #2: Delete and/or add components specific to your community. Not all scoring bullet points may apply to your community and the projects you score. Each community should tailor the scorecard to be relevant to their specific purpose(s) and area.

Step #3: Add up what would be the total highest possible score for your tailored scorecard.

Step #4: Decide your acceptable range for high, medium, and low overall score.

Equitable Development Scorecard Principles: Public subsidies provided to developers and corporations should result in concrete and measurable community benefits for local residents as defined by their community.

1. **Equitable Community engagement practices** require evidence that local community members most affected (low-wealth people, people of color, neighborhood groups, community organizations, people living with disabilities, and new immigrants) are involved in the development project.
2. **Equitable Land Use practices** require evidence that the overall vision, plan, and implementation builds on local community's assets, aspirations, and potential with the intention of retaining current residents and creating public spaces that promote people's health, happiness, and well-being.
3. **Equitable Economic Development practices** that policies and programs work to prioritize community based financial intelligence, sustainable wealth creation, and high quality job opportunities that prevent unwanted displacement of residents and small businesses from low-income communities and communities of color.
4. **Equitable Housing practices** require evidence that families at all income levels have access to housing that costs no more than 30% of the household income.
5. **Equitable Transportation practices** require evidence that transit is integrated into walkable, livable, and affordable land use practices to enhance healthy living within low-income communities and communities of color.

Government Agencies' Principles and Definitions:

Equitable Development - Metropolitan Council, Twin Cities MN.

Definition of Equitable Development:

Equitable development creates healthy vibrant communities of opportunity where low-income people, people of color, new immigrants and people with disabilities participate in and benefit from systems, decisions, and activities that shape their neighborhoods.

Principle of Equitable Development:

The principle is to ensure that everyone regardless of race, economic status, ability or the neighborhood in which they live has access to essential ingredients for environmental, economic, social, and cultural well-being including: living wage jobs, entrepreneurial opportunities, viable housing choices, public transportation, good schools, strong social networks, safe and walkable streets, services parks, and access to healthy food.

Environmental Justice - US Environmental Protection Agency: Environmental justice is the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies.

Sustainable Communities Livability Principles – HUD-DOT-EPA

- Provide more transportation choices.
 - Develop safe, reliable, and economical transportation choices to decrease household transportation costs, reduce our nation's dependence on foreign oil, improve air quality, reduce greenhouse gas emissions, and promote public health.
- Promote equitable, affordable housing.
 - Expand location- and energy-efficient housing choices for people of all ages, incomes, races, and ethnicities to increase mobility, and lower the combined cost of housing and transportation.
- Enhance economic competitiveness.
 - Improve economic competitiveness through reliable and timely access to employment centers, educational opportunities, services, and other basic needs by workers, as well as expanded business access to markets.
- Support existing communities.
 - Target federal funding toward existing communities—through strategies like transit-oriented, mixed-use development and land recycling—to increase community revitalization and the efficiency of public works investments and safeguard rural landscapes.
- Coordinate and leverage federal policies and investment.
 - Align federal policies and funding to remove barriers to collaboration, leverage funding, and increase the accountability and effectiveness of all levels of government to plan for future growth, including making smart energy choices such as locally generated renewable energy.
- Value communities and neighborhoods.
 - Enhance the unique characteristics of all communities by investing in healthy, safe, and walkable neighborhoods—rural, urban, or suburban.

GLOSSARY

Affordable Housing: In general, housing for which the occupant(s) is/are paying no more than 30 percent of his or her income for gross housing costs, including utilities. (U. S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development, 2015)

AMI – Area Median Income: The amount that divides the area’s income distribution into two equal groups, half having income above that amount, and half having income below that amount. Income categories include: Extremely-low income = 30% area median income; Very-low income = 50% area median income; Low income = 60% area median income; and Moderate income = 80% area median-income. **More detailed information on page 6.*

Complete Streets: Transportation policy and design approach that requires streets to be planned, designed, operated, and maintained to enable safe, convenient, and comfortable travel and access for users of all ages and abilities regardless of their mode of transportation. (CONNECT, 2015)

Community: When federal, state or county governments use the word community they most often are referring to cities and municipalities. In this document when we use the term community we are referring to groups of families and individuals who are in relationship to each other either by culture or geography.

Community Benefits Agreement: is a project-specific agreement between a developer and a broad community coalition that details the project’s contributions to the community and ensures community support for the project. Addressing a range of community issues, properly structured CBAs are legally binding and directly enforceable by the signatories. (Partnership for Working Families, 2015)

Community Land Trust: Nonprofit corporations that develop and steward affordable housing, community gardens, civic buildings, commercial spaces, and other community assets on behalf of a community. (Project for Public Spaces, 2015)

Comprehensive Plan is a geographic specific plan that includes all aspects necessary to guide future growth such as: land use, transportation, natural resources, parks and green space, housing, and economic development. Comprehensive plans are created for metropolitan regions, counties, and cities. A comprehensive plan may also include smaller neighborhood and site specific plans such as: small area plan, master plan, and/or development plan.

Environmental Justice: The fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies. (Environmental Protection Agency, 2015)

Environmental standard: State and federal laws that regulate pollution. See EPA <http://www2.epa.gov/laws-regulations> For Minnesota see <http://www.pca.state.mn.us/>

Equity: Just and fair inclusion where all can participate and prosper. (PolicyLink, 2015)

Equitable development: A process for creating healthy, vibrant communities of opportunity. Equitable outcomes result when strategies are put in place to ensure that low-income communities and communities of color participate in and benefit from investments that shape their neighborhoods and regions. (PolicyLink, 2015)

Livability is the sum of the factors that add up to a community’s quality of life—including the built and natural environments, economic prosperity, social stability and equity, educational opportunity, and cultural, entertainment and recreation possibilities. (Partners for Livable Communities, 2015)

Living wage affords the earner and her or his family the most basic costs of living without need for government support or poverty programs. A living wage is a complete consideration of the cost of living. Wages vary according to location, as costs of living vary. (Living Wage Action Coalition, 2015)

Mixed use development: In general, mixed use development is a development that combines two or more different types of land uses, such as residential, commercial, employment, and entertainment uses, in close proximity. In some communities, mixed use may be defined as different uses contained within the same physical structure. (San Joaquin Valley Councils of Government, 2015)

Placemaking is a multi-faceted approach to the planning, design and management of public spaces. Placemaking builds on a local community's assets, inspiration, and potential, with the intention of creating public spaces that promote people's health, happiness, and well-being. (Project for Public Spaces, 2015)

Section 3 – Housing and Urban Development requires that recipients of certain HUD financial assistance, to the greatest extent possible, provide job training, employment, and contract opportunities for low- or very-low income residents in connection with projects and activities in their neighborhoods. (U. S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, 2015)

Social impact assessment - is a process of evaluating the likely impacts, both beneficial and adverse, of a proposed development that may affect ... the quality of life of a community as measured in terms of various socio-economic indicators, such as income distribution, physical and social integrity and protection of individuals and communities, employment levels and opportunities, health and welfare, education, and availability and standards of housing and accommodation, infrastructure, services. (Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity, 2004)

Smart growth helps communities grow in ways that expand economic opportunity while protecting human health and the environment. (Environmental Protection Agency, 2015)

Streetscaping: Public works programs to improve streetscape conditions that can include changes to the road cross section, traffic management, pedestrian conditions, landscaping, street furniture (utility poles, benches, garbage cans, etc.), building fronts, and materials specifications. (North Central Texas Council of Governments, 2015)

Sustainable Communities: Urban, suburban, and rural places that successfully integrate housing, land use, economic and workforce development, transportation, and infrastructure investments in a manner that empowers jurisdictions to consider the interdependent challenges of: 1) economic competitiveness and revitalization; 2) social equity, inclusion, and access to opportunity; 3) energy use and climate change; and 4) public health and environmental impact. (U. S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development, 2015)

Tax abatement: Reduction of, or exemption from taxes granted by a government for a specified period, usually to encourage certain activities such as investment in capital improvements and development projects. A tax incentive is a form of tax abatement. (City of Cocoa, Florida, 2015)

Tax Increment Financing: Tax increment financing (TIF) is a method of financing the public costs associated with a private development project. Essentially, the property tax increases resulting from development are targeted to repay the public infrastructure investment required by a project. (State of Nebraska, 2015). TIF funds can be dedicated for the development of affordable housing.

Transit Oriented Development (TOD): Development of commercial space, housing services, and job opportunities close to public transportation, thereby reducing dependence on automobiles. TODs are typically designed to include a mix of land uses within a quarter-mile walking distance of transit stops or core commercial areas. (U. S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development, 2015)

Transit: Public transportation in the form of buses, bus rapid transit, streetcars, light rail trains, and commuter rail.

Universal Design is the design of products and environments to be usable by all people, to the greatest extent possible, without the need for adaptation or specialized design. (Mace, 2015)

Walkability: A walkable community is one where it is easy and safe to walk to goods and services (i.e., grocery stores, post offices, health clinics, etc.). Walkable communities encourage pedestrian activity, expand transportation options, and have safe and inviting streets that serve people with different ranges of mobility. (Laura Sandt, 2015)

Zoning: The classification of land by types of uses permitted and prohibited in a given district, and by densities and intensities permitted and prohibited, including regulations regarding building location on lots. (Partnership for Working Families, 2015)

Glossary References:

- U. S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. (2015). *Section 3 - Economic Opportunities*. Retrieved from http://portal.hud.gov/hudportal/HUD?src=/program_offices/fair_housing_equal_opp/section3/section3
- City of Cocoa, Florida. (2015). *Ad Valorem Tax Abatement Program*. Retrieved from <http://www.cocoaf.org/index.aspx?NID=168>
- CONNECT. (2015). *Complete Streets*. Retrieved from <http://www.connect.cpex.org/complete-streets/>
- Environmental Protection Agency. (2015). *Smart Growth*. Retrieved from <http://www2.epa.gov/smart-growth>
- Laura Sandt, L. T. (2015). *A Resident's Guide for Creating Safer Communities for Walking and Biking*. FHWA.
- Living Wage Action Coalition. (2015, September). *Campus Living Wage Resources: What is a Living Wage?* Retrieved from http://www.livingwageaction.org/resources_lw.htm
- Mace, R. (2015, September). *Principles of Universal Design*. Retrieved from The Center for Universal Design: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Universal_design
- North Central Texas Council of Governments. (2015). *Streetscapes*. Retrieved from <http://www.nctcog.org/TRANS/sustdev/bikeped/streetscape/index.asp>
- Partners for Livable Communities. (2015, September). *What is Livability?* Retrieved from <http://livable.org/about-us/what-is-livability>
- Partnership for Working Families. (2015, September). *Policies & tools: Community Benefits Agreements and Policies*. Retrieved from <http://www.forworkingfamilies.org/resources/policy-tools-community-benefits-agreements-and-policies>
- Partnership for Working Families. (2015). *Policy & Tools: Affordable Housing Dictionary*. Retrieved from <http://www.forworkingfamilies.org/page/policy-tools-affordable-housing-dictionary>
- PolicyLink. (2015). *Equity Tools*. Retrieved from <http://www.policylink.org/equity-tools/equitable-development-toolkit/about-toolkit>
- PolicyLink. (2015). *Mission Statement*. Retrieved from <http://www.policylink.org/about/mission-statement>
- Project for Public Spaces. (2015). *What is Placemaking?* Retrieved from http://www.pps.org/reference/what_is_placemaking/
- San Joaquin Valley Councils of Government. (2015). *SJV Blueprint Implementation Toolkit*. Retrieved from <http://sjvblueprinttoolkit.weebly.com/principle-6---mix-land-uses.html>
- Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity. (2004). *Akwe': Kon, Voluntary Guidelines for the Conduct of... Social Impact Assessment*. CBD Guidelines Series, Montreal.
- State of Nebraska. (2015, September). *Tax Increment Financing*. Retrieved from Official Nebraska Government Website: <http://www.neded.org/tax-increment-financing>
- U. S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development. (2015, July). *Glossary of HUD Terms*. Retrieved from http://www.huduser.org/portal/glossary/glossary_t.html

U.S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development. (2015, September). *Affordable Housing*. Retrieved from HUD.GOV:
http://portal.hud.gov/hudportal/HUD?src=/program_offices/comm_planning/affordablehousing/

Affordable Housing: What is Area Median Income?

Area Median Income (AMI) is used by HUD (Housing and Urban Development) on the federal level to assess income of families and what cost of housing is affordable to them. Area Median Income means that 50 percent of families in the area are above this income level and 50 percent are below.

“Families who pay more than 30 percent of their income for housing are considered cost burdened and may have difficulty affording necessities such as food, clothing, transportation, and medical care. An estimated 12 million renter and homeowner households now pay more than 50 percent of their annual incomes for housing. A family with one full-time worker earning the minimum wage cannot afford the local fair-market rent for a two-bedroom apartment anywhere in the United States.” (U.S. Dept. of Housing and Urban Development, 2015)

HUD categorizes how housing is affordable by these income levels:

- Extremely low income - 30% area median income
- Very low income - 50% area median income
- Low income - 60% area median income
- Moderate income - 80% area median income

<i>adjusted to the nearest hundreds</i>	Twin Cities 13 county region	Minneapolis	St. Paul
Area (family) Median Income (AMI)	\$86,000	\$64,700	\$65,600
Extremely Low income (30% AMI)	\$26,000	\$19,400	\$19,700
Very Low income (50% AMI)	\$43,000	\$32,400	\$32,800
Low income (60% AMI)	\$51,600	\$38,800	\$39,400
Moderate income (80% AMI)	\$65,800* (*cannot exceed US median)	\$51,800	\$52,500

American Community Survey 1-year data for 2012, adjusted per HUD method used at:
<http://www.huduser.org/portal/datasets/il/il2015/2015MedCalc.odn>

How does this impact what is called “affordable”?

Using the Twin Cities 13 county Area Median Income to determine what is affordable is a problem in the Twin Cities because of the great disparity between incomes in the suburbs versus incomes in the cities and other areas of low wealth people in the region. It is clear that using our region’s AMI as it has been used does not result in affordable housing for residents of Minneapolis and St. Paul or other low wealth areas.

Government agencies typically use HUD standards for affordability when securing federal funds to build and preserve affordable housing. This has not served our low wealth communities well. There is no reason why cities and counties cannot use their own formula for affordability instead of using the 13 county regional AMI. It is our position that local cities and counties should use a method for assessing affordability that takes income disparities in our region into account.

Affordability is also not just about the cost of housing (rental or owner occupied). It includes access to jobs, goods, entertainment, and recreation. It also includes access to medical and government services. To be affordable, these services either need to be within walking/biking distance or easily accessible by public transportation. Housing plus transportation costs should be 50% or less of the household monthly income.

EQUITABLE DEVELOPMENT SCORECARD

Evaluation cover page

Project/Plan name: _____

Is the project part of a bigger land use plan? _____

If yes please attach plan _____

Location: _____

Public Investment(s): _____

Public subsidy funding amount and source _____

Tax abatement amount and source _____

Public land sale and amount _____

Zoning changes/variances _____

Infrastructure improvements (sewer/water, street, sidewalk, etc) _____

Other: _____

Developer: _____

Developer contact info: _____

Public agency _____

Public agency contact info: _____

Other Stakeholders: _____

Description: _____

Community Profile (demographics - please attach additional information to the Scorecard): _____

Equitable Development Total Score: _____

Equitable Community Engagement Score: _____

Equitable Land Use Score: _____

Equitable Economic Development Score: _____

Equitable Housing Score: _____

Equitable Transportation Score: _____

Important note:

Not all of the following scoring bullet points may apply to your work - feel free to tailor the Scorecard to be relevant your effort.

1. **Equitable Community engagement practices** require evidence that local community members most affected (low-wealth people, people of color, neighborhood groups, community organizations, people living with disabilities, and new immigrants) are involved in the development project.

SCORE	MEASURE: Score each bullet point on a scale of 1 – 5 1 being low and 5 being high	Responsible sector: Developer/community/government
	a) Community engagement involves local community members within the first 6 months of the planning process.	
	b) Project was community initiated.	
	c) Planning requires community engagement to establish priorities and criteria for land use and economic development to guide future development and growth.	
	d) Community has authority in the decision making process such as community representation on project advisory team/task force/committee.	
	e) The plan and project includes the community's goals, priorities, and criteria for growth and reinvestment.	
	f) Significant changes to the scope of the plan and/or project triggers more community engagement.	

_____ **TOTAL EQUITABLE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT SCORE**

2. **Equitable Land Use practices** require evidence that the overall vision, plan, and implementation builds on local community's assets, aspirations, and potential with the intention of retaining current residents and creating public spaces that promote people's health, happiness, and well-being.

SCORE	MEASURE: Score each bullet point on a scale of 1 – 5 1 being low and 5 being high	Responsible sector: Developer/community/government
	a) Environmental health, economic prosperity, and social vitality impacts and benefits of land use along with economic development are assessed.	
	b) The development site meets environmental standards on clean air, water, and soil without increasing soil toxicity, air and water pollution.	
	c) Land use increases community ownership such as a community land trust or ownership by local community-based organizations.	
	d) People focused land use minimizes car-oriented design with complete streets elements.	
	e) Development within existing communities maintains or increases density in developed areas to promote better access to emerging amenities such as education, housing, jobs, business, and green space.	
	f) Mixed use zoning supports economic opportunity which includes long-term or permanent affordable housing, small businesses, and commercial development with reliable access to transit.	
	g) Land use within site or within adjacent neighborhood improves the livability of local neighborhoods with streetscaping, public space, and green space.	

_____ **TOTAL EQUITABLE LAND USE SCORE**

We welcome questions or feedback <http://bit.ly/EquityScorecard>

3. Equitable Economic Development practices require evidence that policies and programs work to prioritize community based financial intelligence, sustainable wealth creation, and high quality job opportunities that prevent unwanted displacement of residents and small businesses from low-income communities and communities of color.

SCORE	MEASURE: Score each bullet point on a scale of 1 – 5 1 being low and 5 being high	Responsible sector: Developer/community/government
	a) New capital and investment opportunities are created to promote local small business development, arts/cultural-based businesses, and entrepreneurial opportunities.	
	b) High quality, diversified, and employee-intensive businesses are created to sustain a strong economic base and provide job opportunities for the full employment of a diverse set of skills.	
	c) Lease agreements prioritize neighborhood business opportunities.	
	d) Project uses local workforce/education programs to connect residents to project construction jobs and long term employment within the project.	
	e) Local community is given preference when hiring consultants, contractors, and developers as a strategy to address disparities such as HUD Section 3 program requirement.	
	f) Public funding criteria rewards applicants who ensure that their workers have living wages jobs with benefits and the right to organize for labor agreements without fear of retaliation.	
	g) Design reflects distinct identities of local cultural heritage through the presence, preservation, or addition of architectural assets within a Universal Design.	
	h) Design includes environmentally responsible and resource efficient materials and processes throughout the project's life cycle.	

_____ **TOTAL EQUITABLE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT SCORE**

We welcome questions or feedback <http://bit.ly/EquityScorecard>

3. Equitable Housing practices require evidence that families at all income levels have access to housing that costs no more than 30% of the household income.

SCORE	MEASURE: Score each bullet point on a scale of 1 – 5 1 being low and 5 being high	Responsible sector: Developer/community/government
	a) Housing projects ensure at least 1/3 of units are available for extremely-low (30% AMI), very-low (50% AMI), low (60% AMI), and moderate (80% AMI) income families in mixed-income neighborhoods that are long term or permanently affordable. *See page 6.	
	b) All new housing is built with energy efficiency to reduce utility bills for the residents and is free from environmental hazards.	
	c) Affordable housing is located near amenities (health and social services, transportation, education, and quality job opportunities) that promote walkability, livability, and community.	
	e) An affordability formula includes “housing + transportation” costs that demonstrates residents paying less than 50% of household income for housing and transportation and less than 60 minutes spent in transit.	
	f) Zoning codes promote the integration of affordable housing within mixed income neighborhoods.	
	g) Project includes a designated affordable housing Tax Increment Financing district.	
	h) Displacement prevention strategies such as: Residents’ right of first refusal on new housing and increased property values benefits to current residents.	
	i) _____% of housing accommodates large families by providing 3 to 4 bedroom units.	
	j) Housing accommodates physical/developmental disabilities by incorporating Universal Design.	

_____ **TOTAL EQUITABLE HOUSING SCORE**

We welcome questions or feedback <http://bit.ly/EquityScorecard>

5. Equitable Transportation practices require evidence that transit is integrated into walkable, livable, and affordable land use practices to enhance healthy living within low-income communities and communities of color.

SCORE	MEASURE: Score each bullet point on a scale of 1 – 5 1 being low and 5 being high	Responsible sector: Developer/community/government
	a) Development infrastructure provides safe, attractive, and convenient access to pedestrian, bicycle, and transit systems.	
	b) 30 - 45 minute trip time for pedestrian, bicycle, and transit connections to jobs, education, cultural resources, goods, and services.	
	c) Parking facilities accommodate bicycle daily use and storage and do not limit access by pedestrians.	
	d) Attractive, comfortable, accessible transit facilities are available or provided.	
	e) Presence of wayfinding and systems information for pedestrians, bicyclists, and transit users.	
	f) Development promotes traffic calming and pedestrian safety with the presence of enhanced crosswalks.	
	g) Accessible to all abilities by the incorporation of Universal Design	

_____ **TOTAL EQUITABLE TRANSPORTATION SCORE**